



**TRANSLANGUAGING AT PUBLIC PLACES IN KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA,
PAKISTAN**

Khadija

M.Phil. Scholar, Abdul Wali Khan University, Mardan

Email: khadijakhan731@gmail.com

Sara Qazi

Independent Researcher, Nawar Kali Rustam, Mardan

Email: jamsaraqazi@gmail.com

Abstract

With almost 70 different languages spoken there, Pakistan is a linguistically diverse nation. Code switching and translanguaging are two common multilingual approaches in such an environment. The current study focuses on translanguaging in the public places in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The local markets in Peshawar, Mardan, and Charsadda provide the statistics. Along with gathering data from the shopkeepers, observation and documentation of their interactions with consumers are also conducted. Interviews that are semi-structured and observations are used to gather data. According to Shah, Pillai, and Sinayah (2019), the gathered data is transcribed. The transcribed data is then analyzed by Conversation Analysis by Auer (1984).

The results demonstrate that the speakers interacted with individuals mostly in Pashto. But both the participants mixed different words from Urdu and English in the conversation. The mixing of these languages in their conversations is common because English is the official language of the country while Urdu is the national language. So, both the languages have influence on the mother language, Pashto. The results of the study showed that the participants unintentionally combine Pashto, Urdu, and English languages.

Keywords: Multilingual practices, Bilingualism, Multilingualism, Code-Switching, Translanguaging, Translanguaging in Education, Translanguaging at public places

Introduction

Pakistan is a multilingual country with more than 70 languages used in different domains (Mahboob, 2016). In Pakistan, the most widely spoken languages are English and Urdu. The official language is English, while Urdu is the national language. Apart from that, there are four provinces (Punjab, Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, and Balochistan), and each province has its own prominent regional language. In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, the most widely spoken language is Pashto but, other languages like Urdu, Hindko, and Punjabi are also spoken here. In such a multilingual area, the emergence of multilingual practices such as Code-Switching and Translanguaging is natural.

Code-switching is the act of switching between two or more languages, while Translanguaging is the development of the whole linguistic repertoire by the speakers. According to Velasco and Garcia (2014), TL is the process of understanding input, applying knowledge, and synthesizing a discussion, a task, or a lesson, while CS is the changing of languages during a discussion to replace or translate a term. According to Lin and Garcia (2017), Code-switching and Translanguaging are two different paradigms. In the first place, the goals of both practices are different. The goal of Code-switching is to teach an additional language or teaching itself, while TL focuses on the development of bilingualism. Researchers mainly confuse translanguaging with code-switching but, translanguaging focuses on the individual's full linguistic repertoire or the idiolect. On the other hand, supporters of code-switching look at bilingual practices from the viewpoint of the languages (named languages) (Garcia, 2009). Auer, Myers-Scotton (2005), and Gumperz 1982, differentiate TL from CS and state that CS is based on the monoglossic perspective that bi/multilingual speakers have two or more

distinct linguistic approaches. On the other hand, translanguaging is heteroglossic and posits the linguistic behaviors of bilinguals.

Many studies have been done on Code-switching and Translanguaging but, they are all related to educational institutes (schools, colleges and universities, etc.). Multilingual practices (Code-switching and Translanguaging) are not restricted to educational institutes only but they can occur anywhere whether it is an academic setting or a non-academic setting. Non-academic settings include homes and public spaces like hospitals, bus stops, markets, cafes restaurants, etc. The current research study focuses on translanguaging practices done in public places like the local markets. In the market, the conversations between the shopkeepers and the customers were observed and analyzed. The collected data was transcribed by following the transcription method of Shah, Pillai, and Sinayah (2019). The transcribed data was then analyzed by Conversation Analysis by Auer (1984).

Research Objectives

The following points are the main objectives of this research:

1. To find out the ways people use translanguaging at public places
2. To explore the reasons for using translanguaging at public places

Research Questions

The following questions are the main focus of investigation in the research:

1. How do people translanguage at public places in Pakistan?
2. What are the reasons for using translanguaging at public places in Pakistan?

Review of Related Literature

Multilingual Practices

Multilingual practices are used by bilinguals or multilingual to switch between languages to convey their message. Multilingual practices are common in multilingual countries. In Pakistan, there are more than 70 languages spoken in different areas. The prominent languages spoken in Pakistan are Urdu and English. Urdu is the national language of the country and English is the medium of instruction and official language. So, these two languages are dominantly used languages. English is mostly used in educational institutes as a medium of instruction. Apart from this, Pakistan has four provinces, each with its local language. The other languages that are practiced in Pakistan are Punjabi, Pashto, Balochi, Sindhi Hidhko, etc. In such a multilingual setting, the use of multilingual practices is common and unintentional. The multilingual practices are;

- Code-switching (CS) and
- Translanguaging (TL)

Code-Switching

Code-switching refers to the mixing of two or more languages by bilinguals or multilinguals in the same conversation. It is the process of combining two or more languages in one utterance. At first, translanguaging was confused with code-switching. These two concepts are different. CS is the mixing of two or more languages or the switching between the languages in a conversation while TL is the related to the individual's full linguistic repertoire. It is defined by different scholars in different and unique ways. According to Milroy and Muysken (1995), "Code switching is the alternative employed by people who speak two languages simultaneously in one conversation." Macswan (1999) also stated that "code-switching is an

option of bilingual speakers, in which they move back and forth between their two languages” (Oftentimes, more than) languages”.

Translanguaging

Translanguaging is the use of different languages together. It is the ability to flow freely between languages and pedagogical approach to teaching in which teachers support this ability. According to Garcia (2019), translanguaging is the process by which bilinguals access distinct linguistic aspects or modes of what are known as independent languages to maximize communication potential. Translanguaging is a method of teaching bilingualism that emphasizes nonverbal communication rather than language acquisition.

Studies on Translanguaging

Translanguaging is the use of many linguistic codes in speech and educational contexts, often simultaneously or alternately. This phenomenon tells of a responsive, emergent system that acknowledges language and culture as a complex, intertwined web. Translanguaging is a pedagogical strategy that sees bilingualism as a resource and encourages the use of many language systems, rather than limiting language use to a monolingual discourse structure. Rather than insisting on or imposing a monolingual discourse form, translanguaging involves the strategic use of multiple language systems in communicative practices. This innovative approach has been identified as a powerful implement for facilitating multilingualism as well as aiding in the process of language learning across various spaces, most notably in public spaces. Empirically, translanguaging has been found to deliver multiple affordances in educational contexts, often enhancing pedagogic efficacy, especially amongst students coming from diverse language and cultural L1s. Figuring out these descriptions educators could be somewhat versatile and responsible in creating a fair and all-encompassing arena for discovering, that encourages the cognitive improvement and progressivity of pupils even in a diversity of language settings and configure situation frameworks.

Translanguaging has deep roots in multilingual education. Translanguaging is based on multilingual teaching approaches, namely those used to teach English to Welsh speakers. Lewis et al. (2011) aim to improve the quality of English language instruction.

The term "translanguaging" was coined by Welsh educationist Cen Williams in 1994. According to Lewis et al. (2011), a pedagogical approach involves teachers providing instruction in English and students responding in Welsh. That is why Pratt (1992) made the assumption that interactional events usually take place in a contact zone, a social context where various cultures meet and clash.

Scholars have reviewed translanguaging and identified three key areas of interest for researchers: TL as pedagogy, TL as a skill, and TL as practice. It is a pedagogical approach used by bilinguals to address language barriers. Garcia (2009) examined how translanguaging theory affects bilingual education's pedagogy and language allocation. TL pedagogies allow educators and learners to use all available linguistic resources to create meaning. In contrast, Wei (2011) defines translanguaging as a socially built space for creative and critical communication. Wei's (2011) claim is relevant to our investigation. The current study focuses on public spaces that foster creative and critical communication. Based on Wei's argument, exploring how the market is socially structured for communication can provide valuable insights. Wei's concept of translanguaging can be applied to teaching when students want a translation of a word's meaning. Garcia and Wei considered TL as a useful teaching tool in the classroom.

According to Garcia, Flores, and Woodley (2012), TL can be defined as the process of interpreting the language through language to comprehend it instead. Through TL, one can use any linguistic resource according to the context, and this way, several language uses will be observed. According to Baker (2011), students' cognitive development and understanding can be amplified by TL.

Translanguaging is the efficiency of word formation in diverse languages, with people able to speak, listen, read, and write in many environments (Kavitha 2014). Translanguaging can be considered from different perspectives, it all depends on the context and it is the researchers who use this term. Li Wei, one of the most highly competent linguists in the discipline, illustrates translanguaging as "a native speaker's utilization of a full fluency in all the languages available to him or her without the need of observing the behavioral code that is associated with this speaker's social links and politics" (Wei, 2018, p. 1). Andrew Wei says that translanguaging is "the loose use of bilingual sentences that are neither only one language nor another and instead, allow their users to use the whole linguistic and cultural resources that they have". Angela Creese and Adrian Blackledge point out that translanguaging is the systematic way that people use all the languages they know, including multiple languages as well as dialects, to express themselves. Ofelia Garcia looks at translanguaging as a process through which multilingual speakers employ their languages in the way they join as one single system to make sense of their social worlds (Garcia, 2009, p. 141). In the opinion of Li Wei and Ofelia Garcia, translanguaging includes the interchange of language mechanisms from different languages while relating this to forms of verbal communication, representation, and learning.

Translanguaging in Education

Translanguaging is a pedagogical term that understands that every child and young person comes with his/her linguistic and cultural background and is worthy to be valued. It involves speakers bringing back to their teachers all their repertoires of languages including their first ones for a better learning experience at school. This topic is no longer just a subject of discussion and studies in the field of education, for it is a part of a growing trend. Given that translanguaging in education is a rapidly changing field, it is hard to produce a particular figure of the number of works addressing this issue. While this topic may remain under-researched, there exists nevertheless a sizeable amount of work on it. The issue of translanguaging in educational settings has been a topic of interest to numerous scholars in the last two decades or so. These scholars have published journal articles, research materials, and various books on the issue. Here, the studies concentrate on various problems that revolve around pedagogy, language policy, language development, identity construction, and the reasons behind the advantage of translanguaging in classrooms. Several experts in this field have been evaluating translanguaging in multilingual learning environments. They use the term translanguaging in relation to the phenomenon where students communicate and learn using several languages. They have touched on the effects that translanguaging has on the process of learning to talk, academic attainment as well as inclusive education. Accordingly, the role of translanguaging could be further explored in various educational settings such as multilingual education programs, bilingual or immersion education, content 20 based instruction, and language teacher education. On the contrary, researchers also explored how translanguaging within such language communities and cultural settings shapes people's lives.

Translanguaging at Public Places

Translanguaging is the term applied to the multifaceted and contextual application of multiple languages by different individuals or communities who have various skills in several languages. The translanguaging research field is a developing and dynamic one, and quite a lot of work in that space has been done in different contexts, like public space. The activity could be in a classroom at a school or it could just be an outside setting. It being the supposition, it is everywhere. It is a home, our community that is outside of a formal learning environment. Language use in public is translanguaging – meaning that the spaces of public gatherings, such as markets, shops, public transportation, community settings, and streets, are used with the help of multiple languages and language resources. It is a phenomenon that is all about how people already speak many languages and look for the best approaches to deal with the ‘multilingual public contexts’ communications.

Research Methodology

This research is qualitative in approach. The researcher collected the data from public places like local shops in markets in Peshawar, Mardan, and Charsadda which are the prominent cities in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The data was collected through observations and interviews. To answer question 1, the researcher recorded the interaction of the shopkeepers with the customers. To answer the second question, the researcher interviewed the shopkeepers. The interview consisted of five questions. The collected data is transcribed by following the transcription method of Shah, Pillai, and Sinayah (2019) and then analyzed through Conversation Analysis by Auer (1984).

Data collection and Participants’ Selection

The data was collected from public places in Peshawar, Mardan and Charsadda. In view of the convenience of the researcher, data collection in public places is restricted to local shops only. The participants for the current study comprised of the shopkeepers and the customers of the research area. The data was collected from local markets in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa to determine and analyse the use and motivation behind translanguaging practices among the shopkeepers and customers. A total of 15 random shopkeepers were selected for the study. Their interactions with the customers were observed, recorded, transcribed, and then analyzed. To answer the second question, the researcher selected some educated shopkeepers and interviewed them. Most of them were from the same linguistic background. To keep the shopkeepers and the customers anonymous, the shopkeepers were named S1, S2, S3, and S4, and the customers were named C1, C2, C3, and C4, etc.

Tools for Data Collection

There are three tools for data collection. The first tool for data collection is a recorder. The interaction of the participants (the shopkeepers and the customers) was recorded with a mobile recorder. The interview taken from the shopkeepers were also recorded. The recorded conversations were attentively and then transcribed into written form. Further, it was analyzed by CA.

In the current study, the observation method is used because it allows a researcher to simultaneously observe what, who, where, when, and why things are happening. Creswell (2009), defined observation as it is the practice of acquiring unstructured, first-hand information through taking note of individuals and places at a research site. In the current study, the 36 observation method used was non-participant observation. The researcher passively but directly observed the language use. The researcher observed the interaction of 15 random shopkeepers with their customers.



Interview is a qualitative technique which depends on asking questions to collect data. Cohen (2011) asserts that interviews are a methodical approach to speaking with and listening to people. It is another way to gather information from the people via conversation. The researchers followed a semi-structured interview schedule that outlined the study's research questions, objectives, and aims. In this study, the researcher conducted face-to-face conversations with respondents. According to Creswell (2012), an interview occurs when an investigator asks questions from the participants and records their answers. Interviews are a useful tool for data collection. The interviews were taken from the shopkeepers only. The questions were open-ended for participants to freely share their opinions on translanguaging. The interviews are recorded, transcribed and then analyzed. Fifteen to twenty interviews are taken. The duration of each interview was 4-5 minutes.

Data Analysis

The researcher collected the data from the local markets in KPK through observations and interviews. The conversations of shopkeepers with the customers were recorded through mobile recorders and transcribed informed Shah, Pillai & Sinayah (2019). The transcribed data was then analyzed by the Conversation Analysis by Auer (1984).

Language Usage

Languages spoken in the Local Shops

To identify the languages spoken by the local shops in KPK, the researcher recorded the spontaneous conversation between the shopkeepers and the customers using a mobile recorder. The researcher also used the observation method to interview speakers in the research region, visited every section of the research area, and listened to discussions in order to notice all the languages spoken there. The researcher listened and observed twenty conversations between a shopkeeper and a customer. The researcher found that the shopkeepers used different languages in their conversations on a daily basis. Rather they don't even know that they are using different languages. In the current study, the person used three languages, English, Urdu, and Pashto. As Pashto is the prominent language in this region. So, people use it more often. Urdu is the national language of Pakistan. So, people use it most commonly. English is also used by the people because it is the universal language and the most powerful language and people consider it as a sign of prestige. It has an impact on the people because it is considered the most superior language in the world. So, people use it to show their superiority.

The dominant language used by the shopkeepers and customers

The most dominant language used in the local markets of KPK is Pashto because it is the most widely used language in this area. As Pashto is the mother tongue of the people in this area, it is practiced more often. In example 1, there is a conversation between a shopkeeper and customer about the variety of clothes. They used three languages in their conversation: Pashto, Urdu and English. The whole conversation of the shopkeeper with the customer is in Pashto but both the participants (customer and the shopkeeper) mixed some words from Urdu and English.

Extract 1

S2. Au narma da kna, (yes, it is soft), **asal ke che KAPRA sumra narma e nu taso ta ma owe che polyester na che pak e nu dumra aghe UMAR kam e** (In fact, I told you that the softer the fabric is and the less polyester it has, so its lifespan will be shorter), polyester **che pake e o lag KARAK wale e pa KAPRA k nu aghe bia jwand zyate** (The fabric which

contains polyester and is slightly hard, has a longer lifespan), **da taso yo** season **na dua** season **yay istemaloly she** (you can use it in two seasons), **dy ke ba FARQ na razi** (it will not make any difference).

In the extract 1, the S spoke full utterance is in Pashto but mixed words from other languages as well. KAPRA, KARAK, FARQ and UMAR are words from Urdu and polyester and season are English words. The whole conversation was in Pashto but the participants mixed different words from English and Urdu as well.

Use of Arabic Words in Conversation

In the conversations, the participants (shopkeepers and customers) used some Arabic words. The conversations start with Assalam-o-Alaikum and Walekum Assalam. These are the greeting words in Arabic. Words like Assalam o Alaikum, Walekum Assalam, Alhamdulillah, and Insha Allah are Arabic words and are used in the conversation between the participants. The usage of these words shows the reflection of religion in the conversation between the shopkeeper and the customer. As Pakistan is a Muslim country and the people here follow the teachings of Islam so, the practice of such words is common.

Modified Words

While analyzing the conversation, the researcher found out that the language of the customer was quite well but the language of the shopkeeper was not good enough because the shopkeeper used few words which are English words but he modified them like *varieto*(variety), *compano*(company), *qualito*(quality), *ratona*(rates), and *taim*(time). All of these words are from

English but are modified by the shopkeeper to make it a Pashto word.

Patterns of Translanguaging

This study found that speakers use language to convey their emotions and create meaning. They use their unitary linguistic system to integrate aspects from several languages during conversations. The following translanguaging patterns were observed to have been practiced by the respondents; intra-word TL, intra-sentential TL, and inter-sentential TL.

Intra-word Translanguaging

Intra-word TL occurs when speakers combine many languages to create a single word. The shopkeepers and customers used their common language to communicate via translanguaging at the word level. They combined words from different languages and made a single word. The examples for intra-word translanguaging are given below:

- Ratona(rates)
- Designona(designs)
- Varieto(varieties)
- Compano(companies)
- Qualito(qualities)

The first two words are a combination of English and Pashto words. Rate and design are English words that are mixed with the Pashto suffix (ona) by the shopkeeper to make it plural. Ratona means rates and designona means designs. Similarly, other words like varieto, compano, and qualito are made plural by (o) which is used in the Pashto language for making plural words.

Intra-Sentential Translanguaging

This is the usage of more than one language in one statement. Speakers use intra-sentential translanguaging in their interactions with interlocutors, in addition to translanguaging at the word level. This pattern therefore was observed in the speeches of the shopkeepers and customers at the local markets in KPK. They combined several linguistic elements into a single utterance.

Extract 2.

S2. Stuff **da khkule dy kna da kapray**(the stuff of this cloth is good), **za khu tasu ta waim che da taso ISTEMAL k khpla ba darta ANDAZA oshi**, (I am telling you that you should use it, you will recognize it)

C2. **Da dy rate rasara sahi khbara oka nu bs sahi d bia** (just tell me its price then its ok)

S2. **Nu bs taso ta khu ma kha MUNASIB rate owe** (I told you the appropriate rate), **DO HAZAR kharsom taso ta ba ATHARA SOO RUPAY ke olagi** (I sell it for two thousand rupees, for you it will cost eighteen hundred rupees)

In the mentioned extract, the shopkeeper and the customer used intra-sentential translanguaging in their conversation. Here the S begins the conversation with English word stuff and then switches to Pashto **da khkule dy kna da kapray**. Further, the whole sentence is in Pashto except **DO HAZAR** and **ATHARA SOO RUPAY**, which are Urdu words. C responded in Pashto and used the word **rate** in it, which is an English word. Then, the rest of the sentence is in Pashto. Similarly, in the next sentence, the S responded in the same language Pashto but mixed the English word **rate** and the Urdu words **DO HAZAR** and **ATHARA SOO RUPAY** in the response.

Extract.3

S3. **mung sara da AATH SOO na wala DO HAZAR pore available d.**

In extract 3, the S started the conversation in Pashto and mixed Urdu and English words in it. The Urdu words are **AATH SOO** and **DO HAZAR** and the English word is **available**. Intra-sentential translanguaging occurred here because the participant mixed three languages in on single statement. Similarly, in the extract 4, the inter-sentential translanguaging occurred. Here, the English word is final and the Urdu word is **BARA SOO**. The rest of the sentence is in Pashto language.

Extract.4

C. **Da blue suit okhaya**

S. **Da Facebook blue d, dy ke TEZ blue o PIKA blue hm shta, kam ta che ASMANI blue wai.** In the extract 4, the C started the conversation in Pashto and used two words of English in it. The English words are **blue suit**. The S responded in Pashto but mixed some words of Urdu and English in it. The words like **facebook** and **blue** are English. The Urdu words in the sentence are **TEZ**, **PIKA** and **ASMANI**. These English and Urdu words are mixed with Pashto in a single utterance.

It is concluded from the mentioned examples that the participants (shopkeeper and the customer) mixed the three languages. The languages are Pashto, Urdu, and English. As the research study is conducted in KPK, most of the conversation is in Pashto. By observing the conversations of the participants with each other, the researcher found out that the conversations mostly started in the Pashto language but mixing of the Urdu and English words also occurred. The mixing of the languages in their conversations is intra-sentential Translanguaging because the participants mixed the languages in a single language/ utterance.

Q2. What are the reasons for using translanguaging at public places in Pakistan?

To answer question no 2, a semi-structured interview was conducted. For this purpose, the researcher selected some educated shopkeepers. 15 shopkeepers were selected for the interview. Their interviews were recorded by the researcher, transcribed by following the transcription method done by Shah, Pillai, and Sinayah (2019), and then analyzed by CA by Auer (1984). The duration of each interview was about 4 to 5 minutes. To keep the participants anonymous, the shopkeepers were named S1, S2, S3, and so on. The interview was comprised of five questions. The first question was about the number of languages they speak. The second question was about how they learn languages. The third was related to how often they use these languages. The 49 fourth question was about the reason for translanguaging in public places. In the last question, the researcher asked them about the importance of translanguaging in public places. The researcher concluded from the interviews of the shopkeepers that they mostly used three languages in their interaction with the people/customers. These languages are Pashto, Urdu and English. Pashto is most frequently used language in the areas of KPK because it is the mother of this province. The researcher concluded that the shopkeepers mixed English and Urdu words with Pashto. The researcher concluded from the interviews taken with the shopkeepers that most of the shopkeepers know three languages, Pashto, Urdu, and English, and a few of them also understand and speak Punjabi as well. In response to Q.2, they said that they learned Pashto in their homes because it is our mother tongue. The other two languages were learned by the interaction between the people who know such language. In the answer to Q.3, they said that they frequently use Pashto because they interact mostly with Pashtoons but mix words from English and Urdu in it. According to the shopkeepers, the reason for translanguaging in public places is that in the public places, people come from different linguistic backgrounds. To deal with customers from different linguistic backgrounds, the shopkeeper must know and understand their language. The shopkeepers think that the use of translanguaging is important in public places.

Findings of the Study

The researcher concluded that in KPK people dominantly use Pashto because it is their mother tongue. They speak other languages like Urdu, English and Punjabi etc. The researcher found out that most of the conversations of the shopkeepers with the customers in Pashto but they mixed words from Urdu, English and sometimes Arabic as well. By analyzing the language of shopkeepers, the researcher came to the conclusion that in public places people come from different linguistic backgrounds. In order to deal with the customer of different languages, the shopkeepers switch or change their language. The shopkeepers mostly mixed different languages. They mixed words from Urdu and English in their mother tongue, Pashto. The findings showed that the participants unconsciously mixed different words from other languages.

References

- Adrian Blackledge, A. C. (2017). Translanguaging and the body . *International Journal of Multilingualism*.
- Ahmar Mahboob, R. J. (2016). Bilingual Education in Pakistan and India.
- Angela Creese, A. B. (2019). Translanguaging and Public Service Encounters: Language Learning in the Library . *The Modern Language Journal* .
- Anouk Ticheloven, E. B. (2019). Translanguaging challenges in multilingual classrooms: scholars, teacher and student perspectives. *International Journal of . Working Papers in Translanguaging and Translation* .
- Lamanna, S. (2021). A Qualitative Analysis of Translanguaging by Colombian Migrants in North Carolina.
- Ofelia Garcia, A. M. (2016). Translanguaging in Bilingual Education. *Bilingual and Multilingual Education* .
- Tehseen Zahra, Q. K. (2020). Exploring Logos of Translanguaging in Language Planning of Pakistani Education System . *Kashmir Journal of Language Research* .



- Kavitha, N. (2014), Teacher's attitudes towards and uses of translanguaging in English language classroom in Iowa. Unpublished MA thesis: Iowa State University. Iowa
- Garcia, O. & Wei, L. (2014), *Translanguaging: Language, Bilingualism and Education*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Ameer Ai, M., David, M. K., Manan, S.A. (2021) Translanguaging- A tool for igniting ethnic sensitivities in multiethnic Sindh, Pakistan. *Indonesian EFL Journal(IEFLJ)*.
- Angela Creese, A. B. (2016). Noticing and commenting on social difference: A translanguaging and translation perspective. *Working Papers in Translanguaging and Translation*.
- Boglarka Strazer, J. (2020). Spaces for translanguaging in mother tongue tuition. *Education Inquiry*, 37-55.
- Garcia, O. (2016). Translanguaging in bilingual education.
- Mujahid Shah, S. (2019). Multilingual Practices from Multilingual Perspectives in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. *ELF Annual Research Journal*.
- García, O. (2011). Educating New York's bilingual children: constructing a future from the past. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*.
- Shuzhan Li, W. (2017). Creating Translanguaging Space for High School Emergent Bilinguals. *the catesol journal*.
- Svetlana KARPAVA, N. (2021). Translanguaging space and translanguaging practices in multilingual Russian-speaking families. *Russian Joournal of Linguistics*.
- Urooj Mahmood, M. S. (2021). An Exploration of Linguistic Landscape of District Nowshera- Khyber Pakhtunkhwa: A case study. *Palarach's Journal of Palaentology and Egyptology*.
- Wei, L. (2018). Translanguaging as a Practical Theory of Language. Pages 9–30.
- Yaşar Erdin, P. S. (2020). Translanguaging: Insights into its Theoretical Underpinnings and Classroom Implications. *Journal of Language Research (JLR)*, 1-11.
- Canagarajah, S. (2011), Translanguaging in the classroom: Emerging issues for research and pedagogy. *Applied Linguistics Review*, 2, 1-28
- Creese, A. & Blackledge, A. (2015), Translanguaging in the bilingual classroom: A pedagogy for learning and teaching? *Modern Language Journal*
- Garcia, O., Flores, N. & Woodley, H. (2012), Transgressing monolingual and bilingual dualities: Translanguaging pedagogies. *Harnessing linguistic variation to improve education*.
- Canagarajah, S. (2012), *Translingual practice: Global Englishes and cosmopolitan relations*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Auer, P. (2007), The Monolingual bias in Bilingualism research, or: why bilingual talk is still a challenge for linguistics. In M. Heller (ed.), *Bilingualism: a social approach*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 319-339.
- Baker, C. (2001), *Foundations of bilingual education and bilingualism*, Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.
- Blackledge, A. (2010), *Multilingualism: A critical perspective*. London, UK: Continuum International.